

**MINUTES OF GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE**  
**1<sup>ST</sup> TENDEFR FOR PURCHASE OF DURG / MEDICINES SURGICAL & DISPOSABLE / MEDICAL DEVICES FOR THE YEAR 2024-25. TENDER ADVERTISED AGAINST IPL NO.2517 DATED 28-03-2024**

**MEETING HELD ON 27-05-2024**

A meeting of Grievance Committee was held on 27-05-2024 at 11:00 A.M in the conference room of this Institute regarding Redressal of Grievance against tender for Purchase of Drugs/ Medicines Surgical & Disposable / Medical Devices for the year 2024-25 under the Chairpersonship of Dr. Tahira Arshad, AMS (Emergency & OPD) PIMH, Lahore.

The following members of the committee participated in the meeting: -

1. Dr. Adeel Ayub, In-Charge MSU Member
2. Ms. Mahnoor Azhar, Pharmacist Member

The following Firms/Companies attended the meeting: -

- A. *M/S Glitz Pharma, 205, Muhammadia Plaza, College Road, Rawalpindi.*
- B. *M/S S.A. Knitwear, 193-D, PIA, Housing Society Lahore.*
- C. *M/S Moon Enterprises, 324- Rewaz Garden, Lahore.*
- D. *M/S Hiranis Pharmaceuticals Pvt Ltd, D-41 block 4 Clifton, Karachi.*
- E. *M/S Mega Pharma, 27-KM, Raiwind Road Lahore.*
- F. *M/S Schazoo Pharma (Pvt) Ltd, 71B, C/2 Gulberg-III, Lahore.*
- G. *M/S Fynk Pharma, 299-Hadayat Ullah Block, Mustafa Town, Wahdat Road, Lahore.*
- H. *M/S Magns Pharmaceuticals, 7-B, Value Addition City Khurrianwala Sahianwala Road, Faisalabad.*

The Proceedings started with recitation of the Holy Quran. The following decisions of technical committee were discussed in detail & following decisions were made.

**A. GRIEVANCES SUBMITTED BY M/S GLITZ PHARMA:**

Grievance	Decision
<p>M/S Glitz Pharma submitted following grievance against the decision of Technical Evaluation of bid stating that: -</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>i. "We attached all required documents of API (WHO Approved) and attached GDs, Airway bill/ Bill of lading of Quoted products as per institute criteria and we mentioned in technical proposal our all-Quoted products is WHO approved but the institute give us 05 marks. So please consider our quoted products as per WHO approved criteria. We already attached the documents but for your reference we again attached documents with this grievance. So, in view of above-mentioned facts, we request you to kindly accept our grievance and declared our all Products as Responsive for Healthy competition."</li></ol>	<p>The Grievance committee checked the documents already attached with the technical bid and the staff qualification documents provided with the grievance application in detail of M/S Glitz Pharma against the criteria for technical evaluation of Purchase of Drug / Medicine Surgical &amp; Disposable / Medical Devices for the F.Y. 2024-25. The Committee unanimously decided as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>i. Tender Item No. 7 "Risperidone". Stability chamber 02 marks added. Also, 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter. Moreover, API source from FDA Approval 05 marks are added. Total Marks obtained 51. Hence, the firm is declared <b>Responsive</b> in this item.</li><li>ii. Tender Item No. 8 "Olanzapine". Stability chamber 02 marks added, No supporting documents for FDA</li></ol>

Approval. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter. Hence, total marks obtained are 46 and the firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.

- iii. Tender item No. 9 "Quetiapine". Stability chamber 02 marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter. Total Marks obtained are 48. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.
- iv. Tender item No.11 "Clozapine". Stability chamber 02 marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter Total Marks obtained 48. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.
- v. Tender item No. 12 "Aripiprazole". Stability chamber 02 marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter Total Marks obtained 50. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.
- vi. Tender item No. 16 "Fluoxetine". Stability chamber 02 marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter Total Marks obtained 49. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.
- vii. Tender item No. 17 "Escitalopram". Stability chamber 02 marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter Total Marks obtained 49. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.



- viii. Tender item No. 18 "Paroxetine". Stability chamber 02 marks added, primary reference standard no marks added. 02 marks added in technical staff which was overlooked before. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil. of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter. Total Marks obtained 49. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.
- ix. Tender item No. 19 "Sertraline". Stability chamber 02 marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil. of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter. Total Marks obtained 49. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.
- x. Tender item No. 32 "Topiramate". Stability chamber 02 marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter Total Marks obtained 49. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.
- xi. Tender item No. 33 "Lamotrigine". Stability chamber 02 marks added, FDA Approval 05 more Marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter Total Marks obtained 51. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.
- xii. Tender item No. 35 "Levetiracetam". Stability chamber 02 marks added, FDA Approval 05 more Marks added. 01 mark is added in technical staff qualification when M.Phil. of staff Nafees Muhammad degree was presented along with his appointment letter Total Marks obtained 51. The firm is declared **Responsive** in this item.



**B. GRIEVANCES SUBMITTED BY M/S S.A. KNITWEAR:**

Grievance	Decision
<p>M/S S.A. Knitwear submitted following grievances against the decision of Technical Evaluation of bid stating that: -</p> <p>i. "This is for your kind information that at the time of paper binding above said documents was missed to attach with the bid mistakenly. Now we attached the same documents herewith this letter. So, it is requested to your honor kindly accept our Documents &amp; also reevaluate our bid."</p>	<p>The Grievance committee checked the documents in detail of M/S S.A. KNITWEAR against the criteria for technical evaluation of Purchase of Drug / Medicine Surgical &amp; Disposable / Medical Devices for the F.Y. 2024-25. The committee unanimously decided that the decision of the technical committee will remain upheld as the gross revenue submitted by the firm is less than 150million. Also, the expiry date of the quoted item on finished product packing is not in accordance with the DRAP approval. Hence, the company's grievance is not accepted and it will remain <b>Non-Responsive</b>.</p>

**C. GRIEVANCES SUBMITTED BY M/S MOOM ENTERPRISES:**

Grievance	Decision
<p>M/S Moon Enterprises submitted following grievance against the decision of Technical Evaluation of bid stating that: -</p> <p>i. "Ongoing through the Report we came to know that in Compulsory Parameters we are Technically Non-Responsive. The Reasons are d. GMP Certificate/Final Inspection Report, h. Valid Quality Certification &amp; i. Valid Free Sale Certificate are not attached in our Technical Bid. Please Re-check our Technical Bid that it is not possible. Any how we are enclosing the same again for your ready reference. In regard we also wish to inform your good self that for the last three years we are Participating and Passing Technically in your esteemed organization as well as last year you Re-Tender for this item for 5times and we participate 4times, where we PASSED Technically but Tender Scrapped by your</p>	<p>The Grievance committee checked the documents in detail of M/S Moon Enterprises against the criteria for technical evaluation of Purchase of Drug / Medicine Surgical &amp; Disposable / Medical Devices for the F.Y. 2024-25. The committee found that GMP certificate is not applicable because company is importer not manufacturer. Hence, the company is declared <b>Responsive</b>.</p>

*Amr* *Sp. Jan* ~~ASD~~

good self at all times. Last time we also participate and Win Technically as well as Financially but due to Insufficient Funds this item was not purchased by your good self. Please check your record Keeping in view our Past Business Relations as we are serving your esteemed Organization since 2018 to-date without any Complaint. So, we request that our Grievance may kindly be accepted. On the light of above said Justification, Please Re-check the Same again so that we may can serve better to your esteemed Organization in Future also."

**D. GRIEVANCES SUBMITTED BY M/S HIRANIS PHARMACEUTICALS PVT LTD:**

Grievance	Decision
<p>M/S Hiranis Pharmaceuticals Pvt Ltd submitted following grievance against the decision of Technical Evaluation of bid stating that: -</p> <p>i. "With reference to the technical evaluation report dated 10/05/2024, where our following products mark the technical status as "Non-Responsive" due to leaflet missing in samples. Tender Inq. No.7- Respiredone Tablet 2mg (Zargus) Tender Ing. No.8- Olanzapine Tablet 10mg (Linzap) Tender Ing. No.35-Levetiracetam Tablet 500mg (Lekra) In this regard, we would like to inform you that we provide leaflets in our all products and samples usually but in any case, you didnt find it so we are herewith attached leaflets for samples of above-mentioned products. Kindly consider and accept our above response and mark the technical status of above-mentioned product as "Responsive".</p>	<p>The Grievance committee checked the documents in detail of Hiranis Pharmaceuticals Pvt Ltd against the criteria for technical evaluation of Purchase of Drug / Medicine Surgical &amp; Disposable / Medical Devices for the F.Y. 2024-25. The firm has provided leaflets of quoted items with the grievance application. The committee unanimously considered the grievance. Hence, the firm is declared <b>Responsive</b>.</p>

**E. GRIEVANCES SUBMITTED BY M/S MEGA PHARMA:**

Grievance	Decision
<p>M/S Mega Pharma submitted following grievance against the decision of Technical Evaluation of bid stating that: -</p> <p>i. "According to T.Sr.No.07, Tab. Risperidone 2mg (Quoted Brand Name: Dawn 2mg Tablets). The Department has given us Three '03' Marks in Credibility &amp; Certifications Parameter, Wehave provided valid ISO</p>	<p>The Grievance committee re-checked the documents in detail of Mega Pharma against the criteria for technical evaluation of Purchase of Drug / Medicine Surgical &amp; Disposable / Medical Devices for the F.Y. 2024-25. The Grievance committee added 03-mark in Waste Water Treatment Plant Section. Also, 01-mark added in technical staff as the firm provided technical staff documents along</p>

*[Handwritten signatures and initials]*

14001:2015 and ISO 17025 (Along with Fee Deposit Slip & Inspection Report) and Documents of Waste Water Treatment Plant (Along with Layout & its Operational SOPs). So Please give us Total Nine '09' marks in Credibility & Certifications Parameter. The Department has given us One " Mark in Stability Studies. We have provided along with our technical bid both the accelerated as well as real time stability studies data of our quoted medicine. So Please give us full Two "2 Marks in Stability Studies. The Department has given us Three '03' Marks in Technical Staff of Manufacturing Unit. We have more than 10 No. of Pharmacists & Two Qualified M.Phil Degree holders working in our manufacturing plant (Degrees Along with Appointment Letters already provided in our technical bid), So Please give us Four '04 Marks in Technical Staff Parameter. The Department has given us Four '04' Marks in Availability of Products in Leading Chain Pharmacies. We have provided undertaking on stamp paper & complete set of warranty invoices of five leading chain pharmacies that clearly reflects the availability of our products at chain pharmacies. So please give us full Five '05' Marks in this parameter. In the light of above said facts please consider & review our case and include the missing marks for the final evaluation & give full marks 52 Marks and make our products Technically Responsive".

- ii. "According to T.Sr.No.08, Tab. Olanzapine 10mg (Quoted Brand Name: Olanzar 10mg Tablets). The Department has given us Three 03' Marks in Credibility & Certifications Parameter. i. We have provided valid ISO 14001:2015 and ISO 17025 (Along with Fee Deposit Slip & Inspection Report) and Documents of Waste Water Treatment Plant (Along with Layout & its Operational SOPs). So Please give us Total Nine '09 marks in Credibility & Certifications Parameter. The Department has given us Three '03' Marks in Technical Staff of Manufacturing Unit. We have more than 10 No. of Pharmacists & Two Qualified M.Phil Degree holders working in our manufacturing plant (Degrees Along with Appointment Letters already provided in our technical bid), So Please give us Four '04' Marks in Technical Staff Parameter. The Department has given us Four 04' Marks in A availability of Products in Leading Chain

with the grievance application. Additionally, 01-mark is added in chain pharmacy experience of T.Sr.No.07, Tab. Risperidone 2mg. Hence, total marks obtained are 48 and the committee unanimously accepted the grievance and the firm is declared **Responsive**.

- ii. The Grievance Committee re-checked the documents and added 03-marks in Waste Water Treatment Plant Section which was already provided in the technical bid. Also, 01-mark is being added in technical staff after considering presented supporting documents and 01 mark is added in chain pharmacy experience after considering invoices presented by the firm with the grievance application. Hence, total marks provided are 49 and the firm is declared **Responsive**.



Pharmacies. We have provided undertaking on stamp paper & complete set of warranty invoices of five leading chain pharmacies that clearly reflects the availability of our products at chain pharmacies. So please give us full Five '05' Marks in this parameter. In the light of above said facts please consider & review our case and include the missing marks for the final evaluation & give full marks \$2 Marks and make our products Technically Responsive".

- iii. "According to T.Sr.No.16, Tab/Cap. Fluoxetine 20mg (Quoted Brand Name: Deprezac 20mg Capsule. The Department has given us Three 03' Marks in Credibility & Certifications Parameter. We have Provided valid ISO 14001:2015 and ISO 17025 (Along with Fee Deposit Slip & Inspection Report) and Documents of Waste Water Treatment Plant (Along with Layout & its Operational SOP). So please give us Total Nine '09' marks in Credibility & Certifications Parameter. The Department has given us Three 03' Marks in Technical Staff of Manufacturing Unit. We have more than 10 No. of Pharmacists & Two Qualified M.Phil Degree holders working in our manufacturing plant (Degrees Along with Appointment Letters already provided in our technical bid), So Please give us Four 04 Marks in Technical Staff Parameter. The Department has given us Four 04' Marks in Availability of Products in Leading Chain Pharmacies, We have provided undertaking on stamp paper & complete set of warranty invoices of five leading chain pharmacies that clearly reflects the availability of our products at chain pharmacies. So please give us full Five "05 Marks in this parameter. In the light of above said facts please consider & review our case and include the missing marks for the final evaluation & give full marks 52 Marks and make our products Technically Responsive".
- iv. "According to T.Sr.No.17, Tab. Escitalopram 10mg (Quoted Brand Name; Esse 10mg Tablets). The Department has given us Three '03' Marks in Credibility & Certifications Parameter. We have provided valid ISSO 14001:2015 and ISO 17025 (Along with Fee Deposit Slip & Inspection Report) and Documents of Waste Water Treatment Plant (Along with Layout & its Operational SOPs). So please give us Total Nine '09' marks in

iii. The Grievance Committee awarded 03-marks in Waste Water Treatment Plant which was already provided in the technical bid. Also, 01-mark is given in technical staff and 01 mark is added in chain pharmacy experience after evaluating supporting documents/invoices provided by the firm with the grievance application. Hence, total marks obtained are 48 and the firm is declared **Responsive**.

*Handwritten signatures and initials:*  
M  
M  
M

Credibility & Certifications Parameter. The Department has given us Three '03' Marks in Technical Staff of Manufacturing Unit. We have more than 10 No. of Pharmacists & Two Qualified M.Phil Degree holders working in our manufacturing plant (Degrees Along with Appointment Letters already provided in our technical bid), So Please give us Four '04' Marks in Technical Staff Parameter. In the light of above said facts please consider & review our case and include the missing marks for the final evaluation & give full marks 54 Marks and make our products Technically Responsive. In the light of above said facts please consider & review our case and include the missing numbers for the final evaluation of quoted items and make our products Technically Responsive".

iv. The Grievance Committee awarded 03-marks in Waste Water Treatment Plant Section which was already provided in the technical bid. Also, 01-mark is awarded in technical staff after evaluating supporting documents by the firm with the grievance application. Hence, total marks obtained are 51 and the firm is declared **Responsive**.

**F. GRIEVANCES SUBMITTED BY M/S SCHAZOO PHARMACEUTICALS LABORATORIES PVT LTD:**

Grievance	Decision
<p>M/S Schazoo Pharmaceuticals Laboratories Pvt Ltd submitted following grievance against the decision of Technical Evaluation of bid stating that: -</p> <p>i. "Re-evaluate our product marks of T.E No. 16 Tab/Cap. Fluoxetine, and T.E No. 17 Tab. Escitalopram. Also we would like to inform you here that against T.E no. 100Tab. Naproxen 500 mg. we have quoted Naproxen Sodium 550 mg which is equivalent to 500mg Naproxen, as mentioned in the registration letter, hence kindly re-evaluate these products and consider us <b>RESPONSIVE</b> against all products".</p>	<p>The Grievance committee checked the documents in detail of Schazoo Pharmaceuticals Laboratories Pvt Ltd against the criteria for technical evaluation of Purchase of Drug / Medicine Surgical &amp; Disposable / Medical Devices for the F.Y. 2024-25.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Committee unanimously decided that the specs mentioned on Naproxen Tablet pack is not in accordance with the DRAP approval. Therefore, the firm is declared <b>Non-responsive</b> in this item.</li> <li>Tender item no. 17 "Escitalopram" The grievance of the firm is not accepted by the Grievance Committee and decision of technical committee remains upheld as the because the product experience is not according to the requirement. Hence, the firm is declared <b>Non-responsive</b> in this item.</li> <li>Tender item no. 16 "Tab/Cap. Fluoxetine" The grievance of the firm is not accepted by the Grievance Committee and decision of technical committee is upheld because the firm lacks the required product experience Therefore, the firm is declared <b>Non-responsive</b> in this item</li> </ul>

*Handwritten signatures and initials*

**G. GRIEVANCES SUBMITTED BY M/S FYNK PHARMA:**

Grievance	Decision
<p>M/S Fynk Pharma submitted following grievance against the decision of Technical Evaluation of bid stating that: -</p> <p>i. "API Source of is Not approved by FDA.Given only 05-marks instead of 10-marksQuoted item #35. Levetiracetam 500mg. whereas, we have provided the FDA Approved API Sources ofquoted items along with technical bid with onlineverification. However, we are providing the same again. We request you to give us full marks 10- in this section.</p> <p>ii. We had already submitted Primary referenceGiven only 01-marksinstead of 02-marksQuoted items # 10. Tab. Clozapine 100mg, 17. Escitalopram 10mg, 18. Proxetine 20mg &amp;35. Levetiracetam 500mg. we had already submitted primary reference standard along with our Technical Bid. Now, thefirm has been providing it once again which arevalid. We request you to give us full marks 02-inthis section".</p> <p>iii. "Technical StaffGiven only 02-marks instead of 04-marksITEM # 10, 17, 18 &amp; 35 (as above). We had already submitted the Technical Staff Listalong with their Degree &amp; Appointment Letters alongwith our Technical Bid now the firm has beenproviding it once again. 10- Pharmacist &amp; 02 M.Phil.We request you to give us 04- marks in this section.</p> <p>iv. "Chain Pharmacy AvailabilityGiven only 0-marks instead of 01-marksITEM # 10, 17, 18 &amp; 35 (as above). We had already submitted chain pharmacy availability certificates of AAA Pharma Plus along with our technical bid. Now, the firm has been providing it once again.</p>	<p>The Grievance committee checked the documents in detail of Fynk Pharma against the criteria for technical evaluation of Purchase of Drug / Medicine Surgical &amp; Disposable / Medical Devices for the F.Y. 2024-25.</p> <p>The committee unanimously decided to add 05-marks in FDA approved API Source of Levetiracetam 500mg after verifying online source and the documents provided by the firm with grievance application. However, no additional marks are given in primary reference because the document presented by the firm is not indicating valid shelf life. Moreover, the committee added 02-marks in technical staff after rechecking of the technical bid. Hence, total marks obtained are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tab. Levetiracetam 500mg (53)</li> <li>• Tab. Clozapine 100mg (48)</li> <li>• Tab. Escitalopram 10mg (48)</li> <li>• Tab. Paroxetine 20mg (48).</li> </ul> <p>Hence the firm is declared <b>Responsive</b> by unanimous decision of the Grievance Committee.</p>

**H. GRIEVANCES SUBMITTED BY M/S MAGNS PHARMACRITICALS:**

Grievance	Decision
<p>M/S Magns Pharmaceuticals submitted following grievance against the decision of Technical Evaluation of bid stating that: -</p> <p>"Marking criteria clause No. 6: undertaking for quality of product have been provided with the bid and we are again submitting the stamp stating that samples of quoted products has never been</p>	<p>The Grievance committee checked the documents in detail of Magns Pharmaceuticals against the criteria for technical evaluation of Purchase of Drug / Medicine Surgical &amp; Disposable / Medical Devices for the F.Y. 2024-25.</p> <p>The Grievance Committee unanimously decided to add 05-marks after considering undertaking for</p>

declared substandard by any DTL during last financial year. Kindly grant full 5 marks.

quality of product which was submitted by the firm with the grievance application. Also, 01 mark is added in chain pharmacy experience for all quoted products except Tab. Moxifloxacin after verifying supporting documents submitted by the firm with grievance application.

After considering all the facts the total marks obtained are as follows:

- Tab. Paracetamol (51), Tab. Sertraline (50)
- Tab. Sitagliptin + Metformin (51), Tab. Escitalopram (48) is **Responsive**.
- The firm's grievance for Tab. Moxifloxacin and Tab. Pregabalin is accepted after rechecking the technical bid and documents presented by firm. Therefore, 10 marks are added in experience. Hence, the firm is **Responsive** in these quoted items.
- Tender item No. 16 "Fluoxetine" 01 mark is added in availability of product at major chain pharmacy section after considering supporting document provided by the firm with grievance application. Total Marks obtained for this quoted item are 36. Nonetheless, the firm still remains **Non-responsive** in this item as total marks are less than qualifying marks.

**MS. MAHNOOR AZHAR**  
Pharmacist, PIMH, Lahore.  
(Member)

*1/01/06/24*  
**DR. ADEEL AYUB**  
SMO/In-Charge MSU, PIMH Lahore.  
(Member)

*[Signature]*  
**DR. TAHIRA ARSHAD**  
AMS (Emergency & OPD), PIMH Lahore.  
(Chairperson of Grievance Committee)

*1-06-2024*